RESEARCH ARTICLE

Spectrophotometric study of Solvent extraction of Pb (II) and Cd (II) by aminoocetylphosphonic acid [version 1; peer review: 1 approved with reservations, 1 not approved]

IKHOU Djamila¹, M'hamed Kaid¹, ZIANI Hanane¹, Didier Villemeine²

¹Laboratoire d'études physico-chimique, Department of Chemistry, University of Saida, Dr Moulay Tahar, 20000, Algeria

²EnsiCaen, LCMT, UMR CNRS 6507, INC3M,FR 338,Université de Caen, Caen, France, 14050, France

V1 First published: 10 Nov 2021, 10:1140
<https://doi.org/10.12688/f1000research.54030.1>

Latest published: 10 Nov 2021, 10:1140
<https://doi.org/10.12688/f1000research.54030.1>

Abstract

This study has investigated the solvent extraction of cadmium and lead ions from an aqueous solution in nitrate medium using aminoocetylphosphonic acid (AODPA) as extractant in chloroform. In order to establish spectrophotometrically the concentration of metal ion in the aqueous phase before and after extraction, the Arsenazo III method was used. The effects of several extraction parameters on the extraction of these metals ions including volume ratio between the aqueous and organic phases (1–5), extraction kinetic time (0–30 min), molar ratio Q (1–5), addition of HNO₃ (pH =2–6), addition of KNO₃ (0.01 – 1M), temperature (10–40°C) and the synergetic effect by adding TOPO (solvating agent) were evaluated. Thermodynamic parameters including the Gibbs free energy (ΔG^0), enthalpy (ΔH^0), and entropy (ΔS^0) were calculated. Performed experiments showed that Pb (II) can be extracted till 73% when Cd (II) can be recovered completely after two cycles. The extraction of both metallic ions was spontaneous, endothermic and with a slight randomness. Positive synergetic effect was observed at a chelating agent/TOPO ratio of 3. It is a very encouraging result which can lead us to recover cadmium and lower the concentration of lead from wastewater.

Keywords

Aminoocetylphosphonic acid, solvent extraction, ion-exchange mechanism, Pb (II), Cd (II)

Open Peer Review

Approval Status ? X

	1	2
version 1	?	X
10 Nov 2021	view	view

1. Mohamed Abdelkrim Hasnaoui^{id},
Université Oran, Oran, Algeria
2. Yehezkiel Steven Kurniawan^{id},
Universitas Gadjah Mada, Yogyakarta,
Indonesia

Any reports and responses or comments on the article can be found at the end of the article.

Corresponding author: M'hamed Kaid (kaid_wag@yahoo.com)

Author roles: **Djamila I:** Software, Writing – Original Draft Preparation; **Kaid M:** Conceptualization, Methodology; **Hanane Z:** Investigation, Writing – Original Draft Preparation; **Villemeine D:** Conceptualization, Methodology

Competing interests: No competing interests were disclosed.

Grant information: This work was supported by Dr Moulay Tahar University, Saida, Algeria and “PunchOrga” Network (Pole Universitaire Normand de Chimie Organique), the “Ministère de la Recherche et des Nouvelles Technologies,” CNRS (Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique).

The funders had no role in study design, data collection and analysis, decision to publish, or preparation of the manuscript.

Copyright: © 2021 Djamila I *et al.* This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License](#), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

How to cite this article: Djamila I, Kaid M, Hanane Z and Villemeine D. **Spectrophotometric study of Solvent extraction of Pb (II) and Cd (II) by aminoocetylphosphonic acid [version 1; peer review: 1 approved with reservations, 1 not approved]** F1000Research 2021, 10:1140 <https://doi.org/10.12688/f1000research.54030.1>

First published: 10 Nov 2021, 10:1140 <https://doi.org/10.12688/f1000research.54030.1>

Introduction

The most rejected heavy metals are very polluting and dangerous. Lead and its inorganic derivatives are classified as category 2B (potentially carcinogenic to humans).¹ Lead modifies the cellular functioning by disrupting different physiological processes. It can thus cause blood anemia and renal effects (renal failure). Exposure to lead can affect the central nervous system (developmental delay, irritability, sleep disorders, loss of memory) and have long-term effects on fertility.² The effects of lead are generally amplified in the fetus and child (congenital abnormalities, persistent neurobehavioral deficits).^{2,3} Cadmium, used in several industrial and agricultural processes as well as mining activities and designed carcinogenic by the United States (US) National Toxicology Program can increase the contamination of water and wastewaters around the world.^{4,5} Cadmium can produce or increase the incidence of non-hereditary adverse effects in offspring.⁶ Inhalation, ingestion or skin penetration, even in very small quantities, can cause irritation in the stomach, leading to vomiting and diarrhea, renal insufficiency and, at high doses, chronic bronchitis, fibrosis, emphysema, damage to the bone system, kidney stones and increased blood pressure.⁷⁻¹⁰

In order to eliminate or at least reduce the effects of these cations, many processes have been developed to face dangers towards human health and environment.

The use of the extraction process was widely used thus occupying a special place (for analytical purposes, in the processing of nuclear raw materials and in industries related to the fuel cycle). Solvent extraction consists of treating aqueous industrial waste before it is released into the environment. This process is a very efficient way of upgrading or rendering industrial wastes inert, and to treat discharges contaminated with lead and cadmium, and is generally aimed at recovering these metals, in order to reuse them and thus reduce their eco-toxicological impact.¹¹⁻¹³

The aim of our work was to determine the optimal parameters, at which the extraction yield was maximum, of the solvent extraction of lead (II) and cadmium (II) from an aqueous solution in nitrate medium by a new chelating agent-aminooctyldiphosphonic acid (AAODMDP), dissolved in chloroform, synthesized under microwaves.¹⁴

Methods

Study design and setting

This study was conducted in April 2020 in our laboratory and LCMT Caen (France). The experimental procedure and metal cations analysis is detailed below. In brief after preparing aqueous and organic solutions, contact between the solutions was done. The two phases were separated gravimetrically, and 1 mL of aqueous solution was taken for UV/V analysis.

For synergetic effect, the organic phase was a mixture of our chelating agent (AODMDPA) and a solvating agent (tri octyl phosphine oxide) at different volume ratio.

Reagents and apparatus

The reagents used in this study (with supplier and catalogue number) were: Lead nitrate tetrahydrate $\text{Pb}(\text{NO}_3)_2 \cdot 4\text{H}_2\text{O}$ (99%, Riedel De Haen, 10099-74-8), Cadmium nitrate tetrahydrate $\text{Cd}(\text{NO}_3)_2 \cdot 4\text{H}_2\text{O}$ (99%, Riedel De Haen, 10022-68-1), Arsenazo III $\text{C}_{22}\text{H}_{18}\text{As}_2\text{N}_4\text{O}_{14}\text{S}_2$ (99%, Aldrich, 216-788-6), Nitric acid (65%, Panreac, 7697 37 2), Acetic acid CH_3COOH (80%, prolabo, 64-19-7), Sodium Acetate CH_3COONa (98%, prolabo, 6131-90-4), Potassium nitrate KNO_3 (99%, Riedel De Haen, 7757-79-1), Chloroform CHCl_3 (99% Riedel De Haen, 67-66-3), Aminooctane $\text{C}_8\text{H}_{19}\text{N}$ (Aldrich, 111-86-4), Phosphorus acid (H_3PO_3 , Aldrich, 13598-36-2), Hydrochloric acid (HCl, Riedel de Haen, 7647-01-0), Formaldehyde (HCHO, Aldrich, 50-00-0), Acetone ($\text{C}_3\text{H}_6\text{O}$, Aldrich, 67-64-1), Tri octyl phosphine oxide TOPO ($(\text{C}_8\text{H}_{17})_3\text{PO}$, 78-50-2) and aminooctyldiphosphonic acid (AODPA).¹⁴ Microwave irradiations were performed using microwave oven Synthwave 402 (Prolabo) working at a frequency of 2450 MHz. Nuclear magnetic resonance (NMR) spectra were done on a Fourier Bruker AC multinuclear spectrometer. Ultraviolet-visible spectrophotometry (UV/Vis) spectra were obtained using the UV/Vis double beam Optizen 3220UV spectrometer, a digital pH meter type Consort C863 to follow solution pH.

Synthesis and characterization of Aminooctyldimethylene diphosphonic acid¹⁴

A mixture of aminooctane ($\text{C}_8\text{H}_{19}\text{N}$) (4.96 mL, 30.0 mmol), phosphorus acid (H_3PO_3) (5.02 g, 60.0 mmol), water (3.0 mL) and hydrochloric acid (HCl) 37% (3.0 mL) was irradiated (in a microwave oven) in a glass cylinder reactor fitted with a cooler at 240 W for 2 min. After adding formaldehyde (HCHO) 37% (4.8 mL, 64.46 mmol) rapidly, the mixture was irradiated for 12 min at 240 W. After cooling and evaporation for 5 min, the precipitate was filtered and the white solid was washed with acetone and water.

The product had the following properties: Yield (92 %), mp > 240°C, Formula: $\text{C}_{10}\text{H}_{25}\text{NO}_6\text{P}_2$, ^1H NMR (D_2O , Na_2CO_3): 1.07 (t, 3H, CH_3), 1.15 (m, 12H, CH_2), 3.2 (d, $^2J_{\text{HP}} = 9.01$ NCH₂-P), 3.46 (m, 2H, N-CH₂); ^{31}P NMR (D_2O , Na_2CO_3): d/ H_3PO_4 (ppm) s, 6.7; ^{13}C NMR (D_2O , Na_2CO_3): 19 (s, C1), 25.4 (s, C2), 27.3 (s, C3), 31.7 (s, C3),

51 (d, 2JCP = 137.7, NCH₂-P); **IR** (ν Cm⁻¹): 2925 (vasCH), 1333 (Deformation of (CH₂)_n: n > 4) 1120 (vs P-OH), 1044 (vs P=O), 938 (vsCm ν P-O) (s:symmetric, as: antisymmetric); pKa: 2.75, 8.73, 9.35, (9.67). These values indicated that in the water–acetone media, the first proton was strong and the other protons were weak.

Extraction procedure

After dissolving aminoocetylphosphonic acid in chloroform, the obtained organic solutions were used for extraction studies. Aqueous metal solutions were prepared by dissolving Pb (NO₃)₂ 4H₂O and Cd (NO₃)₂ 4H₂O in distilled water. The first stage consisted of achieving curves of standardization of the absorbance according to the concentration of Pb²⁺ and Cd²⁺. The concentrations were in the range 10⁻⁶-10⁻³ mol. L⁻¹. Pb²⁺ and Cd²⁺ analyses in the aqueous phase after extraction was performed by the Arsenazo III spectrophotometric method which consists of using this chromogenic reagent to form ion-arsenazo III complex. After separation of the organic from the aqueous phase, Arsenazo III was added to the later to form Arsenazo-Ion complex, which was placed in a quartz cuvette after adjusting the aqueous solution pH with buffer solution. The absorbance was learnt at λ_{max} = 610 nm for Pb²⁺ (pH = 4)¹⁵ and λ_{max} = 600 nm for Cd²⁺ (pH = 9.5),¹⁶ the second stage involved optimizing factors of extraction. The volume ratio Vaq/Vorg (the two phases: aqueous and organic; were mixed with different volumes) was carried out to establish the optimal yield of extraction and avoid emulsions, followed by the extraction kinetics (the two phases were stirred for different time). This was carried out to determine the necessary optimal time to reach the extraction equilibrium and for which the yield is maximal. The effect of different concentrations of the extractant (10⁻³M - 10⁻⁶M) on the extraction of the metallic ions was studied. The effect of the ionic strength (a salt (KNO₃) was added to the aqueous phase) and medium acidity (adding an acid (HNO₃) to the aqueous phase at a specific pH) were investigated adding salt or acids to aqueous solutions respectively. Synergetic effect was investigated by adding a solvating agent (Tri octyl phosphine oxide) to the chelating agent (AODPA) in the organic phase then determine the synergetic coefficient.

Results and discussion

In order to easily determine the different extraction factors, emulsions must be avoided. The distribution coefficient, *D*, and the extraction yield, *Y*, defined as follows,¹⁰ will be used to discuss the extraction results:

$$D = \frac{Abs_{org}}{Abs_{aq}} = \frac{Abs_i - Abs_f}{Abs_f} \quad (1)$$

$$Y\% = \frac{Abs_{org}}{Abs_{aq}} = \frac{Abs_i - Abs_f}{Abs_i} \times 100 \quad (2)$$

With the variables being as follows: *Ab_i*, *Ab_f* are the initial and final absorbance of aqueous solutions before and after extraction respectively.

Stirring speed effect

A parameter that appeared essential is the effect of the stirring speed. We noted that a medium stirring speed gave the highest extraction yield for both cations (Figure 1 and 2).²⁷ This can be explained by the fact that at the lowest speed, and

Figure 1. Stirring speed effect on Lead extraction. [Pb²⁺] = 5 × 10⁻⁴ M, Vaq/Vorg = 1, T = 25°C. rpm = rotations per minute.

Figure 2. Stirring speed effect on Cadmium extraction. $[\text{Cd}^{2+}] = 5 \times 10^{-4} \text{ M}$, $\text{Vaq/Vorg} = 1$, $T = 25^\circ\text{C}$.

Figure 3. Effect of volume ratio on extraction yield of Cd^{2+} and Pb^{2+} . Organic phase $[\text{AODMDPA}] = \text{M}$, $[\text{Cd}^{2+}] = [\text{Pb}^{2+}] = \text{M}$, 600 rpm, $T = 25^\circ\text{C}$.

taking into account the ionic radius of Pb^{2+} or Cd^{2+} , the mass transfer is not favored. Also, at the highest stirring speed, the two cations seemed to be des-extracted which will help us in the des-extraction process.

Aqueous to organic phase volume ratio

The effect of volume ratio on the extraction yield of Pb^{2+} or Cd^{2+} was investigated using lead and cadmium nitrate aqueous solutions of $5 \times 10^{-4} \text{ M}$. A concentration of 10^{-3} M of the organic phase was prepared by dissolving aminooctyl diphosphonic acid in chloroform. The results are indicated in [Figure 3](#).

A volume ratio of 1 (which gave the maximum extraction yield) was used in the following experiences since the best-obtained yield of 40% and 25% were obtained, under this ratio, for $\text{Pb}(\text{II})$ and $\text{Cd}(\text{II})$ respectively. It is observed from [Figure 3](#) that the higher the volume ratio, the lowest yield was, caused probably by a repulsion effect between the metal ions.

Extraction kinetics

The extraction kinetics results are shown in [Figure 4](#). The variation of the stirring time between 0 and 30 minutes showed that the maximum yield of 32% was obtained for Pb^{2+} after 15 minutes, and 10 minutes was necessary for the Cd^{2+} . Thus, Pb^{2+} has greater resistance to mass transfer than Cd^{2+} . This can be explained according to the atomic properties of the ionic radius of lead ($1.2 \text{ \AA}$) compared to that of cadmium ($0.97 \text{ \AA}$)

Figure 4. Kinetic of extraction of Lead and Cadmium, [AODMDPA] = M. $[Pb^{2+}] = [Cd^{2+}] = 5 \times 10^{-4}$ M, (Vaq/Vorg) = 1, 600 rpm, T = 25°C.

Figure 5. Molar ratio effect on the extraction of Lead and Cadmium as function of Q. $[Pb^{2+}] = [Cd^{2+}] = 5 \times 10^{-4}$ M, Vaq/Vorg = 1, 600rpm, T = 25°.

Molar ratio effect

The molar ratio, Q, was used to investigate the extraction yield of the two metal ions. It is expressed as:

$$Q = \frac{n_{\text{extractant}}}{n_{\text{metal ion}}}$$

It can be seen in Figure 5, that the extraction of the two metal cations decreases with increasing AODMDPA concentration in the organic phase. The best extraction yields obtained were 55 % and 32% for Cd²⁺ and Pb²⁺ ions, respectively, at a molar ratio Q = 1.

Ionic strength measures the electric field tension in a solution. To verify the influence of ionic strength on the output of extraction, we modified the aqueous phase by the addition of KNO₃ and HNO₃.

Influence of the addition of potassium nitrate (KNO₃)

The concentrations of KNO₃ were taken equal to 0.01 M, 0.1 M and 1 M. The obtained results are shown in Figures 6 and 7. According to the results, we found that there was an increase in the extraction yield of Pb²⁺ ions whatever the quantity

Figure 6. Evolution of the extraction yield of Lead according to Q with the addition of potassium nitrate KNO₃. [Pb²⁺] = 5 × 10⁻⁴ M, Vaq/Vorg = 1, T = 25°C.

Figure 7. Evolution of the extraction yield of Cadmium according to Q with the addition of potassium nitrate KNO₃. [Cd²⁺] = 5 × 10⁻⁴ M, Vaq/Vorg = 1, T = 25°C.

of KNO₃ added to the system. A higher extraction percentage of lead ions in the presence of potassium nitrate can be attributed to the formation of stable complexes of Pb²⁺ in the aqueous phase in the presence of the latter salt.¹⁷ However, Additions of KNO₃ reduce the extraction yield in the case of Cd²⁺. This may be due to the competition between Cd²⁺ and K⁺ ions, which is in accordance with the literature.¹⁸

Influence of the addition of nitric acid (HNO₃)

The effect of nitric acid addition to the aqueous phase before extraction was investigated, in the range of pH 2 – 3, on the extraction of 5 × 10⁻⁴ M of metallic cations. The results are shown in Figures 8 and 9. It was noted that the acidic medium disadvantages the lead ions extraction whereas, that of cadmium ions was seen to be favoured. Similar results were obtained in previous papers.^{19,20}

Figure 8. Evolution of the extraction yield of Lead according to Q with the addition of HNO₃. [Pb²⁺] = 5×10^{-4} M, Vaq/Vorg = 1, T = 25°C.

Figure 9. Evolution of the extraction yield of Cadmium according to Q with the addition of HNO₃. [Cd²⁺] = 5×10^{-4} M, Vaq/Vorg = 1, T = 25°C.

Second extraction step

Another important variable affecting lead and cadmium recovery was studied. In Figures 10, 11, other extraction steps were realized. It was noted that Cd²⁺ can be recovered completely when Pb²⁺ reached 73% after two steps.

Temperature effect

The extraction yield was studied in the range of 10 to 40 ± 1°C. The results are given in Figure 12.

From Figure 8, it noticed that an increase in the temperature from 10°C to 40°C favoured extraction yield. It allows us to predict the Pb²⁺ and Cd²⁺ des-extraction at high temperatures. This may be associated with the increase in the release of water molecules upon dehydration of ions during extraction. This is in good agreement with the results found in the literature.^{21,22}

Thermodynamic parameters calculation

Plots of the ln K values as a function of the inverse temperature [1/T (K)] in the range 283–313 K gave a straight line (Figure 13). The thermodynamic parameters can be determined by the following expressions²³:

$$\Delta G^\circ = -RT \ln K \quad (1)$$

Figure 10. Evolution of the yield according to the second cycle of Lead by AODMDPA. $[Pb^{2+}] = 5 \times 10^{-4}$ M, $V_{aq}/V_{org} = 1$, $T = 25^\circ C$.

Figure 11. Evolution of the yield according to the second cycle of Cadmium by AODMDPA. $[Cd^{2+}] = 5 \times 10^{-4}$ M, $V_{aq}/V_{org} = 1$, $T = 25^\circ C$.

Figure 12. Effect of temperature of the extraction yield of Lead and Cadmium, $[AODMDPA] = 10^{-3}$ M $[Pb^{2+}] = [Cd^{2+}] = 5 \times 10^{-4}$ M, $(V_{aq}/V_{org}) = 1$.

Figure 13. Variation in Ln K in function 1/T for Lead and Cadmium extraction with AODMDPA.

Table 1. Thermodynamic parameters of the lead and cadmium at 298 K.

Cation	ΔG° (Kcal/mol)	ΔH° (Kcal/mol)	ΔS° (Cal/mol.K)
Pb ²⁺	− 0.526	+ 17.30	+ 59.82
Cd ²⁺	− 0.091	+ 15.80	+ 53.34

$$\Delta G^\circ = \Delta H^\circ - T\Delta S^\circ \quad (2)$$

From these equations (1) and (2) we pull the following equation (3) to calculate ΔH° and ΔS° while drawing the curve LnK according to the temperature.

$$\ln K = \Delta S^\circ / R - \Delta H^\circ / RT \quad (3)$$

The numerical values of ΔH° , ΔS° are computed from the slope.²⁴ The negative value of Gibbs free energy as shown in Table 1 indicates the spontaneous nature of extraction, while positive value of ΔH° reflects the endothermic extraction behavior. The positive value of ΔS° may be due to the increase in randomness around the chelating function.²⁵

Figure 14. Synergetic effect of the extraction yield of Cadmium according to Q. [Cd²⁺] = 5 × 10^{−4} M, (Vaq/Vorg) = 1; (AODMDPA: TOPO = 3: 1), T = 25°C.

Figure 15. Synergetic effect of the extraction yield of Lead according to Q. $[Pb^{2+}] = 5 \times 10^{-4}$ M, (Vaq/Vorg) = 1; (AODMDPA: TOPO = 3: 1), T = 25°C.

Table 2. Different synergetic coefficients of Tri octyl phosphine oxide and phosphonic Acid (TOPO/AODMDPA) according to molar ratio Q. Q: molar ratio Q₁: Q = 1, Q₂: Q = 2, Q₃: Q = 3, Q₄: Q = 4, Q₅: Q = 5. D₁: Distribution factor using TOPO alone. D₂: Distribution factor using AODMDPA alone. S: Synergetic factor $S = \log \frac{D_{1+2}}{D_1 + D_2}$.

Cation	Molar ratio Q	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q5
Pb (II)	D₁ TOPO	0.096	0.108	0.116	0.056	0.047
	D₂ AODMDPA	0.44	0.377	0.375	0.383	0.381
	D₁₊₂ (AODMDPA + TOPO)	0.879	0.989	1.031	1.063	0.969
S₁ > 0 (positive synergy)		0.214	0.309	0.322	0.384	0.354
Cd (II)	D₁ TOPO	0.115	0.131	0.140	0.143	0.148
	D₂ AODMDPA	1.882	1.164	0.885	0.699	0.614
	D₁₊₂ (AODMDPA + TOPO)	2.130	2.363	1.461	1.220	1.017
S₂ > 0 (positive synergy)		0.028	0.26	0.166	0.161	0.125

Synergetic effect

In order to study the synergetic effect, Tri octyl phosphine oxide TOPO (solvating agent) was added to our extractant (chelating agent) at 298 K. The synergetic coefficients were obtained as described by M. Taube and al.²⁶

Different phosphonic/TOPO volume ratios were tested presenting negative coefficients maybe because of steric and competition phenomena in the organic phase. The best synergetic coefficient was obtained at a phosphonic acid/TOPO volume ratio of 3 (Figures 14 and 15). The synergistic enhancement is attributed to the formation of complexes with the two extractants. Different positive synergetic coefficients are gathered in Table 2 showing that whatever the molar ratio, a positive synergetic coefficient was obtained.

Conclusion

A new phosphonic acid extractant named aminooctylphosphonic acid easily synthesized under microwave using low-cost chemicals. Complete achievement of Cd²⁺ can be reached when Pb²⁺ extraction reaches 73% after two cycles. A positive synergetic effect was observed at an AODMDPA/TOPO ratio of 3. It is a very encouraging result that can lead us to recover Cd²⁺ and lower the concentration of Pb²⁺ from wastewater.

Data availability

Open Science Framework: Spectrophotometric study of Solvent extraction of Pb (II) and Cd (II) by aminooctylphosphonic acid. <https://doi.org/10.17605/OSF.IO/FMHT4>.²⁷

This project contains the following underlying data:

- NMR Spectra
- Raw tables

Data are available under the terms of the [Creative Commons Zero “No rights reserved” data waiver](#) (CC0 1.0 Public domain dedication).

References

1. Martin S, Griswold W: **Human health effects of heavy metals.** *Environ. Sci. Technol. Briefs Citizens.* 2009; **15**: 1–6.
2. Mason, Lisa H, Jordan P, et al.: **Pb neurotoxicity: neuropsychological effects of lead toxicity.** *BioMed Res Int.* 2014; 8.ID 840547
3. Dashtian K, Zare-Dorabei R: **An easily organic-inorganic hybrid optical sensor based on dithizone impregnation on mesoporous SBA-15 for simultaneous detection and removal of Pb (II) ions from water samples: response-surface methodology.** *Appl. Organomet. Chem.* 2017; **31**: e3842.
[Publisher Full Text](#)
4. Sienkiewicz J: **Effect of heavy-metals industry on plant communities.** *Sci. Total. Environ.* 1986; **55**: 339–349.
5. Gupta N, Khan DK, Snatra SC: **An assessment of heavy metal contamination in vegetables grown in wastewater irrigated areas of Titagarh, West Bengal, India.** *Bull. Environ. Contam. Toxicol.* 2007; **80**: 115–118.
[PubMed Abstract](#) | [Publisher Full Text](#)
6. Rahimzadeh MR, Rahimzadeh MR, Kazemi S, et al.: **Cadmium toxicity and treatment: An update.** *Caspian J Intern Med.* 2017 Summer; **8**(3): 135–145.
[PubMed Abstract](#) | [Publisher Full Text](#) | [Free Full Text](#)
7. Gupta VK, Yola ML, Atar N, et al.: **A novel sensitive Cu (II) and Cd (II) nanosensor platform: Graphene oxide terminated p-aminophenyl modified glassy carbon surface.** *Electrochimica Acta.* 2013; **112**: 541–548.
8. Pat C: **Polyamine compounds containing phosphonic, sulfonic and carboxylic radicals and their preparing process.** *China Pat.* 2000; **1243833**; CAN 133:271319.
9. Eur. Pat: **Method and compositions for controlling calcium sulfate scaling in mining circuits.** *Eur. Pat.* 1993; **538026**; CAN 119: 55656.
10. Tewari PK, Singh AK: **Preconcentration of lead with amberlite XAD-2 and XAD-7 based chelating resins for its determination by flame atomic absorption spectrometry.** *Talanta.* 2002; **56**(4): 735–744.
[PubMed Abstract](#) | [Publisher Full Text](#)
11. Seubert A, Klingenberg A: **Sulfoacylated macroporous polystyrene-divinylbenzene: a new type of cation exchanger for the analysis of multivalent metal cations.** *J. Chromatogr.* 1997; **A 782**,2: 149–157.
[Publisher Full Text](#)
12. Didi MA, Kaid M, Villemin D: **Dodecylhydroxydiphosphonic acid for solvent extraction.** *Solvent Extr Ion Exch.* 2008; **26**(2): 113–127.
[Publisher Full Text](#)
13. M'hamed K, Mohamed AD, Didier V: **Poly (aminomethylenephosphonic) acid for solvent extraction of metal ions.** *Chemistry & Chemical Engineering, Biotechnology, Food Industry.* 2011; **12**,269–280.
14. Boulenouar I, Kaid M'h, Abbas O, et al.: **Solvent Extraction of Lanthanum (III) and Europium (III) from Nitrate Media by Aminooctylidimethylene Diphosphonic Acid.** *Solvent Extraction Res Devel., Japan.* 2016; **23**(1): 51–61.
[Publisher Full Text](#)
15. Michalova V, Kuleva N: **Arsenazo III as a spectrophotometric reagent for determination of lead.** *Talanta.* 1979; **27**: 63–66.
[Publisher Full Text](#)
16. Michalova V, Yuroukova L: **Arsenazo III as a spectrophotometric reagent for zinc and cadmium** *Analytica chimica acta. Elsevier Sci.* 1973; **68**: 73–82.
[Publisher Full Text](#)
17. Soltani H, Yaftian MR, Zamani A, et al.: **Selective Liquid-Liquid Extraction of Lead Ions Using Newly Synthesized Extractant 2-(Dibutylcarbamoyl) benzoic Acid.** *Anal. Bioanal. Chem. Res.* 2015; **2**(2): 91–98.
[Publisher Full Text](#)
18. Jha MK, Kumar V, Jeong J, et al.: **Review on solvent extraction of cadmium from various solutions.** *Hydrometallurgy.* 2012; **111–112**, 1–9.
19. Konczyk J, Kozłowski C, Walkowiak W: **Lead (II) removal from aqueous solutions by solvent extraction with tetracarboxylresorcin[4]arene.** *Physicochem. Probl. Miner. Process.* 2013; **49**(1): 213–222.
[Publisher Full Text](#)
20. Sonmez E, Sonmez F, Kumbasar RA, et al.: **Synergistic and selective extraction of Cd²⁺ from acidic solution containing Cd²⁺, Co²⁺, Ni²⁺ by triisooctylamine (TIOA) and tributyl phosphate (TBP).** *J Industrial Engineering Chemistry.* 2012; **18**: 1286–1292.
[Publisher Full Text](#)
21. Huang C: **Rare earth coordination chemistry: fundamentals and applications.** Singapore: John Wiley & Sons (Asia) Pte Ltd.; 2010. p. 1–39.
22. Kolarik Z: *Gmelin handbook of inorganic chemistry.* 8th ed. Berlin: Springer-Verlag; 1982; 34–227.
23. Yaftian MR, Hassanzadeh L, Eshraghi ME, et al.: **Solvent extraction of thorium (IV) and europium (III) ions by diphenyl-N,N-dimethylcarbamoylmethylphosphine oxide from aqueous nitrate media.** *Sep Purif Technol.* 2003; **31**: 261–268.
[Publisher Full Text](#)
24. Chen D, Chen J, Luan X, et al.: **Characterization of anion-cationic surfactants modified montmorillonite and its application for the removal of methyl orange.** *Chemical Engineering J.* 2011; **171**: 1150–1158.
[Publisher Full Text](#)
25. Soltani H, Yaftian MR, Zamani A, et al.: **Selective Liquid-Liquid Extraction of Lead Ions Using Newly Synthesized Extractant 2-(Dibutylcarbamoyl) benzoic Acid.** *Anal. Bioanal. Chem. Res.* 2015; **2**(2): 91–98.
26. Taube M, Siekierski S: **Nukleonika, General remarks on synergic effects in the extraction of uranium and plutonium compounds.** *Nukleonika.* 1961; **6**: 489–502.
27. M'hamed K, Djamilia I, Hanane Z, et al.: **Spectrophotometric study of Solvent extraction of Pb (II) and Cd (II) by aminoocetyl dimethylene Diphosphonic acid.** 2021, August 12.
[Publisher Full Text](#)

Open Peer Review

Current Peer Review Status: ? ✖

Version 1

Reviewer Report 19 December 2022

<https://doi.org/10.5256/f1000research.57474.r158212>

© 2022 Kurniawan Y. This is an open access peer review report distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License](#), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Yehezkiel Steven Kurniawan

Department of Chemistry, Universitas Gadjah Mada, Yogyakarta, Indonesia

- 1) The authors describe the harmful effects of lead(II) and cadmium(II) ions in the introduction but no explanation of why the authors use aminooctyldiphosponic acid structure as the extraction agent.
- 2) As a new compound, the HRMS measurement of aminooctyldiphosponic acid shall be reported.
- 3) Statistical error bars were reported in Figure 2 but other Figures do not show any error bars. Please revise the other Figures with error bars.
- 4) The authors give a small portion of the discussion of the experimental results and focus on reporting the experimental data without enough explanation/description.
- 5) How to recover the extraction reagent? Did the authors do the stripping experiment?

Is the work clearly and accurately presented and does it cite the current literature?

Partly

Is the study design appropriate and is the work technically sound?

No

Are sufficient details of methods and analysis provided to allow replication by others?

Yes

If applicable, is the statistical analysis and its interpretation appropriate?

Partly

Are all the source data underlying the results available to ensure full reproducibility?

Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the results?

Partly

Competing Interests: No competing interests were disclosed.**Reviewer Expertise:** Solvent extraction, Metal separation, Separation engineering, Metal-organic framework, Heterocyclic compounds

I confirm that I have read this submission and believe that I have an appropriate level of expertise to state that I do not consider it to be of an acceptable scientific standard, for reasons outlined above.

Reviewer Report 20 September 2022

<https://doi.org/10.5256/f1000research.57474.r148149>

© 2022 Hasnaoui M. This is an open access peer review report distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License](#), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Mohamed Abdelkrim Hasnaoui

Laboratoire de Chimie des Matériaux-LCM, Université Oran, Oran, Algeria

Page 3 : Extraction procedure:

$$Q = \frac{n_{\text{Extractant}}}{n_{\text{Metal}}}$$

- Authors should give the definition of Q the “molar ratio” and why it’s fixed to 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5. It’s mentioned that different concentrations of the extractant (10^{-3}M to 10^{-6}M) have been studied. These values are not compatible with the Q ratios given on figures 1 and 2, when $[M^{2+}] = 5 \cdot 10^{-4}\text{M}$ ($M = \text{Pb}^{2+}$ or Cd^{2+}). If the concentration of the cation is fixed, the concentration of the extractant should vary from $5 \cdot 10^{-4}$ to $25 \cdot 10^{-4}$.

Page 4 : Results and discussion

- It’s more convenient to start with stirring time (Kinetic) in order to get the optimal time of extraction.
- The parameter time has not been mentioned anywhere. Once this parameter is fixed, the volume ratio must be investigated followed by volume ration and molar ratio.
- The investigation of the volume ratio (figure 3), has the molar ratio is close to 2 (see concentration of M^{2+} and organic phase). This parameter “volume ratio” should be investigated again at $Q=1$ for a convenient comparative study.
- The comparison of the maximum %yield obtained, it can be seen a substantial difference. The maximum %yield of Cd^{2+} extraction reached 83 % (figure 2) when only 55% (figure 5) was obtained at (600rpm; $V_a/V_{org}=1$, and $Q=1$ fixed). (see table below). It can also be seen that the maximum of %yield of cadmium obtained after 10 mn is close to 31 % (figure 4),

while 83% was obtained when stirring speed was investigated (figure 2). This Result needs more interpretation. See table:

<https://f1000researchdata.s3.amazonaws.com/linked/452329.Table.png>

Effect of KNO₃ addition:

- On figure 6, it's mentioned that the max %Yield obtained for free-KNO₃ solution (initial Pb²⁺) when, Va/Vorg=1, 600rpm and Q=1, is lower than mentioned on figure 1 (32 %).
- On page 7 "*..can be attributed to the formation of stable complexes of Pb²⁺ in the aqueous phase in the presence of the latter salt..*": the authors tried to explain the augmentation of the yield of Pb²⁺ by the stability of the complex in the presence of KNO₃. The authors are invited to explain why only for weak concentration 0,01M, the complex is stable?
- Likewise, for better comparison the study should be investigated even at molar ratio Q=1. Because, it can be shown, that for the free-KNO₃ solution, %Yield of cadmium is close to 65 %, while it reached 81 % when molar ratio Q=1 (figure 1). This lead to suppose that probably higher yield than 92% will be obtained at Q=1.

Influence of temperature:

- On page 8: "*..It allows us to predict the Pb²⁺ and Cd²⁺ des-extraction at high temperatures..*". There is no *extremum* for the two curves to predict the des-extraction by extrapolation, the study should be extended to others temperature higher than 40°.
- The procedure to keep the temperature constant should be given in experimental section.

Conclusion

- Rephrase the conclusion in a way that covers all the results obtained.

Is the work clearly and accurately presented and does it cite the current literature?

Partly

Is the study design appropriate and is the work technically sound?

Yes

Are sufficient details of methods and analysis provided to allow replication by others?

No

If applicable, is the statistical analysis and its interpretation appropriate?

I cannot comment. A qualified statistician is required.

Are all the source data underlying the results available to ensure full reproducibility?

Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the results?

Partly

Competing Interests: No competing interests were disclosed.

I confirm that I have read this submission and believe that I have an appropriate level of expertise to confirm that it is of an acceptable scientific standard, however I have significant reservations, as outlined above.

The benefits of publishing with F1000Research:

- Your article is published within days, with no editorial bias
- You can publish traditional articles, null/negative results, case reports, data notes and more
- The peer review process is transparent and collaborative
- Your article is indexed in PubMed after passing peer review
- Dedicated customer support at every stage

For pre-submission enquiries, contact research@f1000.com

F1000Research